TVET DIAGNOSTIC TOOL: PATHWAYS TOWARDS DEMAND-BASED PARTNERSHIPS
A Handbook for TVET managers
Acknowledgements:

AUIC and AUDA-NEPAD would like to thank GDI—Global Development Incubator for the technical support in compiling this paper as well as all representatives from GIZ who have assisted in the creation of this report.

This report was written in partnership with the Global Development Incubator (GDI): Alice Guguleu, Jay Shah, Alexis Teyie, Gichobi Mwangi, Cheikh Pape Cisse. The team would like to recognize the Global Opportunity Youth Network (goyn.org) as a critical source of the insights included here. GOYN is hosted by the Aspen Institute Forum, led by Jamie McAuliffe, and delivered in partnership with GDI and other stakeholders.

GOYN is a multi-stakeholder initiative committed to creating place-based systems shifts for youth economic opportunity. Working with Anchor Partners situated in communities around the world, we work to create economic mobility for “Opportunity Youth” — young people aged 15-29 who are out of school, unemployed, or working in informal jobs. GDI is an incubator for transformational development ventures, working to build and scale the next generation of social impact solutions. Whether these concepts originate from sector experts, or are developed and tested ourselves, we create new approaches to address persistent global issues.

Contents

Section 1: Introduction

4

Section 2: What constitutes a demand-responsive TVET ecosystem

4

Section 3: What role should TVETs and other actors play in this ecosystem

9

Section 4: What standards should TVETs set for demand-based partnerships?

9

Section 5: What does your score imply and how can this handbook be used?

10

Section 6: Guidelines for enhancing effective private sector partnerships

11

- Design and implement analysis-based private sector engagement strategies
  - A. Research and assess market needs
  - B. Identify and prioritise selected partners
  - C. Understand key hiring requirements

- Adopt and scale demand-based curriculum design
  - A. Offer courses relevant to market demands
  - B. Design curriculum to meet private sector needs

- Embed partnerships in curriculum delivery, particularly with employer partners
  - A. Build the skills of teaching and training staff to deliver the curriculum
  - B. Provide relevant equipment and teaching materials

- Integrate and roll-out work-based learning opportunities within all training programs
  - A. Create work-based learning opportunities eg. apprenticeships and internships

- Invest in private sector engagement personnel or partnerships teams
  - A. Develop effective guiding principles for private sector partnerships
  - B. Dedicated resource for private sector engagement

- Establish trainee profiling systems during intake, and regularly track alumni outcomes in the job market
  - A. Profile trainees and track their career journeys
  - B. Collect continuous feedback both employer partners and alumni
  - C. Invest in a collaborative learning system

- Explore innovative TVET business models, and push for cost-share agreements with employer partners
  - A. Explore innovative TVET business models, and push for cost-share agreements with employer partners

- Establish internal controls, and advocate for greater autonomy over programming with local and national governments
  - A. Establish internal controls and empower leadership to advocate for greater autonomy
  - B. Review and adapt partnerships

Section 7: Appendix and references

References

28

External references

29
Section 1: Introduction

We have an unprecedented opportunity to significantly reform TVETs, making your work easier and fulfilling the potential of TVETs across Africa. Certainly, your trainees and alumni, local and national governments, private sector partners spanning multinationals and small informal businesses all have a role to play in unlocking the full value of TVETs to youth livelihoods and national economies. We expect, though, that TVET staff like yourself will lead the partnerships needed to develop demand-responsive TVET systems.

Over the last two decades, the case for partnerships in demand-responsive or demand-driven vocational education has been established. In fact, when we spoke to other TVET staff, they reiterated these same benefits of partnering, especially with employers: developing higher quality programming and demand-based skills-training; improving career outcomes for TVET students; enhanced financial and operational management. To fully tap into the benefits of partnership, TVETs cannot continue to rely on organic, ad hoc engagements, which are rarely strategic.

Section 2: What constitutes a demand-responsive TVET ecosystem?

On (Page6,7), we break down the core differences between supply-oriented TVETs and what we are working towards: demand-responsive systems.

We have identified four (4) domains of consideration
i) strategic and operational planning;
ii) curriculum and training;
iii) stakeholder management; and
iv) institutional capacity.

According to our analyses, these are the most pertinent areas within TVET systems. Across these four domains, we have further identified eight (8) components which act as levers of change and can therefore indicate growth opportunities for individual TVET institutions. Based on the juxtaposition of supply-driven and the more effective and efficient demand-responsive systems, we use the same eight components to identify specific opportunities and recommendations for three key actors in the system: TVETs, employers and government (Page 6,7). We also offer TVETs a practical tool to score their current capabilities in leveraging partnerships based on our recommendations across the eight levers of change. TVETs can then use their ratings per the scorecard to identify and adopt detailed guidance to improve their performance (Page 8).

We know that TVET systems can be quite varied spanning vocational centers, technical secondary schools, colleges, polytechnics, community skills hubs, and private training companies. While we are confident that these recommendations could support any TVET to collaborate in new or enriched ways with other partners, we invite you to tailor the guidance to your particular context. This is a shared and living document, so we can work together to ensure this tool is fit-for-purpose and responsive to your needs as TVET staff.

Where a supply-oriented system is focused on output-level results, like enrolment, attendance and graduation rates, a demand-responsive TVET system is focused on delivering positive livelihood outcomes for its trainees. By making improvements using the levers of change we introduced in (Page 6,7), TVETs could facilitate and stay accountable for the impact that matters most for their trainees and their communities:
- High placement rates - the fraction of graduates who are placed in employment, or who launch an entrepreneurial venture
- High retention rates - the fraction of graduates who stay on the job, and may be eligible for career progression. For entrepreneurs, this would capture the survival rate of founded ventures.
- Good quality of work - the fraction of graduates whose work opportunities would be considered ‘decent’ as per the International Labour Organization: “productive and delivers a fair income, security in the workplace and social protection for families, better prospects for personal development and social integration, freedom for people to express their concerns, organize and participate in the decisions that affect their lives and equality of opportunity and treatment for all women and men.”
### MARKET ASSESSMENT

- Regularly signal talent needs and growth projections within sub-sectors and regions, directly to TVET committees or through national labour market information systems.

### CURRICULUM DESIGN

- Adapt and scale demand-based curriculum design.
- Maintain and share detailed occupational competencies across relevant hiring categories with TVET partners.

### CURRICULUM DELIVERY

- Embed partnerships in curriculum delivery, particularly with employer partners.
- Contribute expertise as industry experts, mentors or access to relevant equipment.

### WORK-BASED LEARNING

- Invest in private sector engagement personnel or partnerships teams.
- Allocate partial human, resources or talent staff time to a ‘youth-employee’ or TVET partnership.

### MONITORING AND EVALUATION

- Establish simple profiling systems during intake and regularly track alumni outcomes in the job market.
- Implement performance benchmarks and carry out regular quality assurance and regulatory service provider audits.

### GOVERNANCE

- Prioritize customer satisfaction.
- Diversify revenue streams and focus on better quality assurance and regulatory service providers.
- Ensure accountable governance and an effective regulatory framework.

### STRATEGIC AND OPERATIONAL PLANNING

- Design and implement analysis-based, private sector driven, strategic strategies.
- Consolidate and validate regional labour market information, review and rate locally sourced market data from an integrated platform, and flag key trends for relevant actions.

### FINANCIAL SUSTAINABILITY

- Explore innovative TVET business models, and push for co-share agreements with employer partners.
- Where value is established, formalize cost sharing agreements with TVETs through in-kind support, grants, project levies or other relevant mechanisms.

### INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY AND STRUCTURE

- Implement coherent, innovative and effective workforce policies.
- Establish strong institutional control and governance.
- Mobilize stakeholders to co-design policies and standards, including vocational qualification frameworks and competency based training systems.

### STAKEHOLDER MANAGEMENT

- Support capacity building and development of management systems for demand-oriented TVET planning.
- Limited accountability for key results, particularly trainee feedback outcomes.

### CURRICULUM AND TRAINING

- Full-time, often civil service secure or long-term contracts, low turnover; spend time exclusively in the training institution.
- Staff may be poorly motivated and underpaid.
- Fixed assets, often outdated equipment - may be underused.

### MANAGEMENT

- Short-term contracts, use of part-time staff, sometimes rapid turnover; staff partner with enterprises to adapt and deliver training.
- Trainers are certified and compensated based on industrial experience.

### INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY

- Facilities and equipment -- may be underprovided.
- Fixed assets, often outdated equipment.
- Staff may be poorly motivated and underpaid.
- Turnover; spend time exclusively in the training institution.
- Tenure or long-term contracts, low underpaid.

### KEY

- **DOMAIN**
  - Strategic and Occupational Planning
  - Curriculum and Training
  - Stakeholder Management
  - Institutional Capacity and Structure

- **LEVERS OF CHANGE**
  - Market Assessment
  - Curriculum Design
  - Curriculum Delivery
  - Work-based Learning
  - Management
  - Monitoring and Evaluation
  - Financial Sustainability
  - Governance

- **RATING & SCORE**
  - Low
  - Low - Medium
  - Medium - High
  - High - Critical
  - Critical

- **A Handbook for TVET managers**
  - Governments
  - Employers (private sector, public sector and civil society)
  - Institutions
Section 3: What role should TVETs and other actors play in this ecosystem?

As we flagged earlier, the work towards fully demand-responsive TVETs must be a joint effort. On Page 6, we use the same eight components which require intervention and identify clear recommendations for three key actors: TVETs themselves (both public and private TVETs), employers (private sector, public sector and civil society) and governments. There are definitely other actors who influence and are influenced by TVETs, such as financial institutions, nongovernmental organizations and certainly the trainees and alumni served by TVETs. Fortunately, across several African countries, we noticed positive trends across public policy, TVET enrolment and employer engagement. This is our opportunity to take advantage of this momentum to radically improve vocational education and training. We would like this tool to support the TVETs’ evolution to demand responsiveness. However, we acknowledge that the insights and recommendations we have synthesized here only become meaningful when implemented and adapted. We invite you to propose areas of collaboration and partnership with the full range of stakeholders. The next chapter zooms in on specific guidance for TVETs, but we look forward to co-creating support for other key players within TVET systems, like employers and government.

Section 4: What standards should TVETs set for demand-based partnerships?

From the components we explored above, we identified critical growth areas within TVETs’ direct sphere of influence. The TVET Demand-Based Partnerships Scorecard we designed is structured around these eight components (Page 8).

The components are listed on the left. The top row shows our rating system; you can score between 1 (Low) and 5 (High). Each rating is associated with detailed information according to a spectrum for each component. Think of it as a scale you could slide left to right, depending on your performance. You could have a medium-high [4] score on Component 1 and then rate a [Low-Medium] 2 on another component. These are designed to be simple enough to administer within your team, without an external evaluator.
Section 5: What does your score imply and how can this handbook be used?

If your TVET institution scored above 30 (out of a maximum of 40), you are among some of the most high-performing TVETs in forging effective demand-led partnerships. We would love to hear from you on [email address] to learn more about the best practices you have implemented in your institution, and share your success stories for others to learn from. Please reach out to us!

The ratings are not final! Your scores are a way to identify areas for improvement. It is possible to improve your score; and, remember that without sustained effort, your score could worsen. The rest of the handbook is organized by the scorecard components. If you perform lower than expected on a particular component, you can navigate directly to that section in the handbook and review our simple and straightforward guidance to close the gap between your score and a higher rating.

Before you begin to implement the guidance below to improve your score, we recommend you set up a private sector engagement task force that consists of the following elements:
- Acknowledge that creating a demand-driven approach requires a change in the culture and behaviour of the organisation. This requires thoughtful engagement from multiple stakeholders within the TVET. It takes great effort to change something that “is always done this way” - but setting a student-centric vision can help to rally the right people behind the initiative.
- Ensure the right people are part of the conversation. Teaching staff, administration and key TVET management need to align on the importance and priority of forming effective private sector partnerships. Meet regularly with people they are designed for. Young people’s perspectives are critical, and will ensure that the solutions implemented will deliver the most value for the people they are designed for.
- Involve your trainees throughout the process. Young people’s perspectives are critical, and will ensure that the solutions implemented will deliver the most value for the people they are designed for.
- Present occupational interests of local youth
- Additional skills of the workers preferred by employers
- Numbers of workers available at present in specific occupations
- Numbers of workers required in specific occupations in a predetermined area
- Present occupational interests of local youth
- Existing technical training providers available in the local area

While the focus of this handbook has been to form effective partnerships with the private sector; some of the guidance can be used and adapted for partnerships with the public sector too. The public sector remains a large demand driver for employment in several countries - and we encourage you to apply some of these learnings to public sector partnerships.

Section 6: Guidelines for enhancing effective private sector partnerships

Design and implement analysis-based private sector engagement strategies

A. RESEARCH AND ASSESS MARKET NEEDS

A market scan provides basic information from the local labour market in terms of the potential employers, skills required and various entry level job opportunities. This provides TVET managers with vital information that will enable them to make informed decisions on curriculum design and delivery.

WHAT
A well-conducted market scan can inform the design of skills training programs and improve their market relevance. The market scan can help determine the profile of students to target, ensure that skills training is concentrated in occupations and sectors with growth and employment potential, and inform the content of skills training such that it is responsive to the specific needs of local employers.

WHY
TVETs that seek to improve their score in this domain can use a Rapid Market Assessment (or Appraisal). RMA is a tool to help youth livelihood and employment projects assess the supply and demand for labor and skills within specific occupations or sectors of the local labor market. RMAs provide basic information about the local labor market, such as:
- Numbers of workers available at present in specific occupations in a predetermined area
- Numbers of workers required in specific occupations in a predetermined area
- Additional skills of the workers preferred by employers
- Present occupational interests of local youth
- Existing technical training providers available in the local area

RMA uses a range of simple and easy methods and tools for collecting quantitative as well as qualitative market information. The following tools are normally used in collecting data in RMA process:
- Semi-structured interview guide to collect market data
- Direct observation for context analysis.
- Focus group discussion for verification and collection of qualitative data

Example (Case 1)
CAPYEI Kenya has a structured format which guides their market scan using primary and secondary resources to inform their decision making process. The market scan permits them to identify the skills that are in demand by employers in their respective region, and the profiles of youth and the employment challenges they face. CAPYEI’s 7 Step Market Scan includes:
1. Identify the area to be covered
2. Set up a Market scan team (make sure key staff are included)
3. Select the person to lead the Scan team
4. Carry out desktop and field survey of data
5. Analyse data: creating a profile of key sectors that have potential for employment or business
6. Team meets to critically discuss findings
7. Decision made on course profiles to offer

Source: How to Make TVET Work for Kenya
B. IDENTIFY AND PRIORITISE SELECTED PARTNERS

WHAT
A basic assessment can be done to rate the attractiveness and feasibility of different partners to help the TVET identify which partners it should prioritize and why.

WHY
Not all partnerships are equal, and TVETs should pursue the partnerships that are most valuable to them with their limited resources. Developing partnerships is a time intensive process for most TVETs and therefore being selective about who to partner with yields better results.

HOW
Potential partners can be identified based on this guidance developed by USAID (https://www.usaid.gov/sites/default/files/documents/1880/Workforce_Guide.pdf):

- Which private sector stakeholders would benefit from improved linkages with higher education resources, and is there possibility for collaboration?
- Who are the most valuable / strategic actors? Which companies have already shown an interest or invested in workforce development? Do any companies have their own private foundations that are dedicated to social investments?
- Who are national, regional, district/local and municipal political leaders who can act as “champions” for the goals of the partnership’s programs? What associations exist that bring together government leaders (association of mayors, city councils, etc.) or link government with private sector and citizens?
- Would international institutions (like the International Labor Organization) or NGOs (like Business for Social Responsibility or the UN’s Global Compact) have information on private sector partners that are interested or involved in workforce development issues in your country or region?
- Are there microfinance institutions that could provide information on what skills are needed by local entrepreneurs and MSMEs?
- Are there existing local and national workforce development intermediaries that bring the private sector together with education and training providers?
- Consider diaspora communities. Are there companies created by diaspora that might be interested in investing in home-country enterprises or training programs?

Selected partners can then be prioritized based on the attractiveness of the partner, and the feasibility of the partnership.

Factors driving attractiveness of the partner: Number of jobs offered, average compensation, relevance of partner in the market, potential to scale partnership, ...

Factors driving feasibility of the partnership: Existing relationships, evidence of similar partnerships, CSR statements supporting youth employment, ...

C. UNDERSTAND KEY HIRING REQUIREMENTS

Example (Case 2)
Generation Kenya employs a demand-driven model in cooperation with the Government of Kenya, development partners, the private sector, and public and private training institutions to fill the void between unemployed youth and employers. They have partnered with over 250 employers and 35 TVET institutions to support graduates. Generation conducts a landscape analysis to find companies that are capable of hiring, along with an “activity mapping” for employers which lays out the specific tasks that institutions should train graduates for. To properly allocate resources, Generation does not conduct course training unless they can assure that 80% of the vacancies can be filled for partnered employers.

Source: Generation Kenya
**Adopt and scale demand-based curriculum design**

**A. OFFER COURSES RELEVANT TO MARKET DEMANDS**

Within each respective industry that the TVET trains workers for, the institution should have a clear understanding of the range of demand in the landscape. This means offering a range of courses that are relevant for the needs within the sector.

**WHY**

The starting point for meeting the needs of prospective employers is offering a range of courses that caters for these needs. This ensures that students can find the right training for the roles available in the market.

**HOW**

The market scan done by the TVET should directly inform the range of courses offered by the TVET. This may require either (1) the introduction of new courses, (2) removal of certain courses from the offering if they don’t meet market needs, or (3) shortening the training duration of courses to allow students to ‘refresh’ or upskill rapidly.

**Example (Case 3)**

Wayne Adams the CEO of the The Manufacturing, Engineering and Related Services Sector Education and Training Authority (merSETA) in South Africa states, “for a TVET to be relevant is to understand the needs of your customers. You have to give employers what they want, or else they will establish their own centers”. Employers know that the success of their business or organisations depends on good employees in order for it to grow. The TVET sector is the largest provider of employees, through the training they offer. Unfortunately, many of these TVET institutions do not do a very good job, leading frustrated employers to spend their own resources to further train the people they hire. If your TVET institution can solve this problem, it will become very popular with potential employers and they will be willing to engage with you. The other reason is that employers are members of the community concerned with many of the same issues that we in TVET are concerned about. Engaging employers in TVET work is equivalent to inviting them to be part of the solution even as they secure distinct benefits from doing so.

**B. DESIGN CURRICULUM TO MEET PRIVATE SECTOR NEEDS**

Arguably, the most influential point for TVETs to partner with the private sector is on curriculum design. This entails having the private sector partner participating as a high-level advisor to guide the curriculum for a particular course, or as a technical expert in the design of specific components of a training program. This includes guidance on:

- The aims and objectives of the course
- The length of the course, size of intake and other logistical factors
- Technical aspects of the training (i.e. the content covered and equipment used)
- The teaching and learning methods implemented
- The assessment strategy (what is tested)

**WHY**

Studies in several African countries are showing an urgent need to reform the structure and materials used to teach students at TVET schools. In countries like Rwanda and South Africa, students graduating from TVETs are not able to meet the skills demands of the job market because of the insufficient training that they are receiving. Engaging the private sector in key aspects of curriculum design allows the TVET course to be more responsive to the needs of the partner, and therefore increasing the chances of successful placement. Specifically, it helps enhance the relevance of the curriculum to meet the employer’s needs. It raises awareness of the content and culture for learning among TVETs and the line of sight to work for students is made clear. Additionally, teachers and trainers will enhance their practice through spending time, working alongside employers and gaining knowledge in terms of current industry practice. Overall, such collaboration between TVETs and private sector partners in the design of the curriculum taught to prospective students helps improve the efficiency of the labor market effect on the economy.

**HOW**

There are several stages in which the private sector can engage with the TVET. Consultation and engagement with the private sector could take several forms, based on the readiness of the TVET and the willingness of the private sector partner to engage.

- TVETs design own learning modules and upgrade it to the demands of the private sector
- TVET consult the private sector partner during the development of the curriculum
- TVETs and private sector partners jointly design the curriculum

Consultation and co-design of curriculum could occur in workshops and working sessions.

**Examples**

The retail & hospitality sector in West Africa has generated over 8 million jobs, but the sector lacks enough capable employees with critical soft skills that in turn hinders productivity. The West Africa Vocational Education (WAVE) in Nigeria has trained over 50,000 students using industry-centric curriculum design. In partnering with companies such as JetBlue and SouthWest Airlines, they have quick program cycles that last 2-3 weeks which address the immediate needs of employers.
Embed partnerships in curriculum delivery, particularly with employer partners

**A. BUILD THE SKILLS OF TEACHING AND TRAINING STAFF TO DELIVER THE CURRICULUM**

**WHAT**

TVET teachers and trainers are best positioned to deliver the curriculum when they are equipped with industry-standard company-based training. Companies can supply TVET teachers with in-house training, or in-house trainers can attend pedagogical training taught by experienced corporate personnel or training organized by umbrella organizations such as chambers of commerce. (Euler, 2017, p. 22; OECD, 2009, p. 53).

**WHY**

The TVET system’s quality is heavily dependent on the quality of its teachers and trainers. It is essential that teaching and training professionals have access to high-quality professional development in order to enhance their technical and pedagogical skills. Lack of training results in a lack of solid practical expertise, and employees cannot keep up with the fast-changing needs of modern industries (OECD, 2009, p. 49).

**HOW**

TVETs can partner with the private sector to improve the skills of trainers in several ways:
- TVETs and private companies can set regular accreditations of competence that meet industry standards. Kenyan competency-based training (CBET) for instance, identifies accreditation indicators for each level of trainer qualification and verifies the equivalent qualifications. Private sector can then review and approve the accreditations. This will ensure that the quality of trainers is high.
- A partnership between TVET and the private sector can ensure that trainers seek Continuous Professional Development (CPD) periodically. To ensure compliance with industry standards, CPD accreditation should be developed in partnership with the private sector.
- Strengthen the technical skills of trainers through regular workshops and training.
- Recruit and pay instructors based on industrial experience to reduce inertia in staff capacity.
- Deliver certain components of training to address specific skill needs e.g. by providing a technical expert as a guest tutor.
- Provide tools, equipment or materials for training purposes, this resources will be aligned to the curriculum.
- Provide feedback to the TVET as an assessment of the quality and relevance of the training.

**Example**

The Senegal-Japan CFPT is one of the first training institutions that specializes in industrial machine maintenance in Senegal. Established in 1984, this relationship is a shining example of public-private partnership between two countries along with industry. The government of Japan provided equipment from an internationally recognized Japanese manufacturing company Komatsu. This was an ideal form of support for the CFPT as Komatsu is well established in the country with distributors of their products. Source: Evaluation of Japan’s Cooperation in the Education Sector in Senegal

**B. PROVIDE RELEVANT EQUIPMENT AND TEACHING MATERIALS**

**WHAT**

Private sector can provide support by providing relevant equipment and training materials to TVETs. TVETs can be supported by companies by providing them with modern equipment, they can grant, sponsor the purchase, lease or allow their equipment to be used for training. Companies can also share practice-oriented teaching materials.

**WHY**

TVET students benefit from modern and relevant equipment to gain experience and exposure to modern production methods. This will avoid the current situation of students being trained with obsolete equipment (as in most TVET programs), which is difficult to transition for graduates into working with modern equipment. Moreover, learning materials will provide information that is both practical and relevant.

**HOW**

Private sector players can provide support in the following way:
- Private sector partners can provide relevant equipment to TVETs: TVETs can conduct an internal equipment audit for equipment used in training. On the basis of the findings, they can seek support from the private sector to fill the gaps. There are a number of ways to accomplish this:
  - Equipment sponsorships: The private sector purchases equipment for TVETs.
  - Donation: Private sector donates equipment to TVETs.
  - Lease: Companies could lease their premises for practical training at a low cost or for free.
- Private sector can provide teaching materials: TVETs can audit content relevant to training areas, and once they identify the gaps, they can approach relevant organizations for updated information and/or materials.
- TVETs can explore how their facilities can be used by the private sector (especially local companies) to test new ideas, innovate and research new concepts - allowing trainees to be highly involved in the process.

**Example (Case 4)**

The national power utility Compagnie Ivoirienne d’Électricité (CIE) has had their employees trained by the Training Center for Electricity Trades (CME) since 1970. CME’s success has resonated throughout the continent, as they provide training for students from various countries. CIE is in close collaboration with CME by providing or donating equipment or materials for training purposes which are consistent with the current industry standards. Source: Engaging the private sector in electricity training.
Integrate and roll-out work-based learning opportunities within all training programs

A. CREATE WORK-BASED LEARNING OPPORTUNITIES E.G. APPRENTICESHIPS AND INTERNSHIPS

TVETs build connections with the private sector and jointly identify opportunities for on-the-job training in the form of apprenticeships and internships. TVET prepares trainees for the workplace by collaborating with the private sector to identify skill gaps. This adds value to the TVETs’ demand-driven training.

WHY
Facilitating the transition to work during the students’ classroom experience creates a fluid conduit between the TVET and the world of work. Instead of taking several months to train new employees through orientation, including classroom experience creates a fluid conduit between the classroom and workplace learning.

HOW
Private sector can contribute to work-based learning by providing apprenticeship and internship opportunities, to achieve optimal results. TVETs need to achieve the following:

- Aligning skilling to demand
- Determine the types of skills they wish to develop training
- Map skills demand with the private sector
- Together with the private sector co-design curriculum to meet the specific needs
- Align classroom to workplace learning
- Identify potential companies that can offer apprenticeship/internship opportunities

Example (Case 5)
A good example of work-based learning is being conducted by The Education Development Center with their APTE-Sénégal project organizes career days, invites professionals to speak at schools, and organizes visits to workplaces. Lower secondary students are also invited to “discover” the world of work by initiating their own conversations with professionals. Source: APTE-Midterm-Report.pdf

Example (Case 6)
EDC’s Work Ready Now is the fundamental topic for Auchan Senegal’s professional staff development program. Work Ready Now teaches kids how to have a positive attitude, model courteous behavior, and improve their speaking and listening, collaboration, customer service, and leadership abilities. The program has aided EDC’s workforce development efforts in Mali, Rwanda, and the Philippines in the past. Auchan and APTE-Sénégal worked together for several months to integrate Work Ready Now capabilities into the company’s existing professional development, performance protocols, and occupational safety and health standards. They collaborated to create a series of soft skills training sessions that addressed the most prevalent development obstacles that Auchan Senegal workers face on the job.

Source: Building Market Share and Market Skills

Invest in private sector engagement personnel or partnerships teams

A. DEVELOP EFFECTIVE GUIDING PRINCIPLES FOR PRIVATE SECTOR PARTNERSHIPS

Effective partnerships attempt to adhere to a set of guiding principles to ensure that partners are able to harness the shared value of the partnership. These principles extend beyond TVET partnerships with the private sector, and can be applied to other partnerships that TVETs may engage with.

WHY
These principles can be used to have a learning conversation among partners early in the formation of the partnership. They are a good way to discuss groups’ values and aspirations, as well as jointly create language that will guide the partnership. However, it is important to remember that the principles offer guidance, and are not simply a checklist. In addition, flexibility is critical as there is no one size fits all when it comes to effective partnerships.

HOW
Some overarching principles that guide the design on partnerships can include:

- Participation: Effective partnerships meet the interests of the different partners involved, by giving them a chance to input on the design, implementation and monitoring of programs to reflect their needs.
- Mutual benefit: Each partner should seek to capture mutual benefit, by sharing their commitment to other partners as well as to the shared partnership, leading to deeper engagement. All partners have valuable resources and expertise, as well as risks and benefits that lead to a complementary purpose and respect.
- Inclusivity: Partners play an essential role in encouraging participation and ensuring different experiences, needs and capabilities of various groups in a community are heard, including those of women and men, youth and the elderly, persons with disabilities and the able bodied, ethnic minorities and majorities.
- Accountability: Partners are accountable to each other when they honour their commitment to communicate and are responsible for what they actually do. Accountability requires transparency. This involves creating a system in which administrative systems, rules and regulations are public knowledge, clear in meaning and apply equally to everyone.
- Coordination: In order to avoid duplication and inefficient use of resources while maximizing opportunities and effectiveness, partners commit to regulate sharing of information from relevant programs and the context. This includes with each other and where possible and applicable with others working in the area.
- Learning: Partners acknowledge that each has different experiences and by learning from each other we can enrich our organizations and the people we aim to serve. Additionally, in identifying shared interest and pursuing joint learning we build our relationship and the capacity of the partnership.

Example (Case 7)
CAPYEI in Kenya uses the Basic Employability Skills Training (BEST) model to efficiently engage employers directly. Their first step includes conducting market scan research where they request potential employers to provide data on employment possibilities and relevant skills sets they require from employees. This information is used to develop the training curriculum for each respective training module. During the development of the curriculum, employers are once again consulted to refine the details of skills training. CAPYEI hosts “road shows” to mobilize and recruit potential youth for training by interviewing them to determine their qualification for training. The partners and private sector actors that are engaged by CAPYEI are encouraged to help identify candidates also.

Source: The Role of Partnerships in Youth Skills Development: The Case of CAPYEI Basic Employability Skills Training (BEST) Model in Kenya
### B. DEDICATED RESOURCE FOR PRIVATE SECTOR ENGAGEMENT

#### WHAT

Within the TVET administration there should be at least one person who is charged with creating and maintaining relationships with the employers. Even if there is not an officially recognized position for this role, engagement with the private sector should be prioritized as a primary goal for the institution.

#### WHY

Once the partners to pursue have been identified, the TVET partnership managers can work to establish guiding principles and develop a compelling value proposition for the private sector organisations. A private sector partner that has been sufficiently involved in curriculum design and delivery and whose hiring needs are appropriately met by the content of the course on offer by the TVET would have little reason to engage with employers and markets as a whole. Over time, routine analyses of these data would improve alumni career journeys could include a combination of carrying out surveys, to determine their destinations (industry, role, quality of work) as part of formal evaluations, or sourcing direct feedback from alumni and employers. Tracer studies focus on evaluation and/or impact assessment of the compatibility of knowledge and skills acquired with their job. They are designed to provide information on a sample of graduates who are studied repeatedly over time to monitor their transition into the world of work.

#### HOW

In the initial stages, TVETs can allocate specific roles to existing staff. Over time, a TVET can appoint a partnership manager on a part-time or full-time basis to support the implementation of the guidance in this handbook. TVET talent policies can prioritize hiring partnerships or private sector engagement teams. Such staff would mobilize the team to identify potential employers, make a clear case for support and effectively manage such an engagement over the long-term. The next level beyond having an individual dedicated to engaging with employers would be to have an established department that has a strategically mapped out process and task list relating to the private sector.

---

**Example (Case 8)**

Despite being a government agency, DHET in South Africa has a department that is solely tasked with private sector engagement. They recommend that TVETs hold recruitment drives and provide much-required resources during training as concrete actions to attract employers. Guided by South Africa’s National Development Plan 2030, DHET approaches private sector engagement by lending assistance to partner organisations to increase the level of private sector representation in decision-making bodies and facilitating systematic stakeholder dialogue. 

**Source:** National Plan for Post-School Education and Training

---

**What**

Profiling involves collecting information of enrolling trainees as part of the intake process. Such trainee profiles generally include demographic data (age, gender, disability status). A demand-driven TVET also uses the profiling process to collect baseline skills/competencies of their trainees as well as career interests.

Tracking alumni career journeys could include a combination of conducting surveys, to determine their destinations (industry, role, quality of work) as part of formal evaluations, or sourcing direct feedback from alumni and employers. Tracer studies focus on evaluation and/or impact assessment of the compatibility of knowledge and skills acquired with their job. They are designed to provide information on a sample of graduates who are studied repeatedly over time to monitor their transition into the world of work.

**Why**

Strong profiling and journey tracking of trainees enables TVETs to verify the results of their programs (do they create career success?), and enhance their performance by collecting up to date market information from their own alumni. TVETs with robust tracking mechanisms could identify and withdraw components within their curriculum content and delivery which are not applicable in the labour market. Over time, routine analyses of these data would improve trainee experience within TVETs, better prepare graduates for the world of work, and deepen their contribution to employers and markets as a whole.

**How**

There are various methods to collect both profile and career outcome information from trainees. For the profiling, a simple paper or digital questionnaire can be embedded in existing intake processes, trainee orientation, or through the trainers’ first courses. A TVET scoring 5 on this component will collect demographic data, skills level and career interests of their incoming trainees.

For career and outcome tracking of graduates, TVETs can utilize one or a combination of the following methods:

- **Alumni surveys:** whether or not your TVET has established a thriving alumni network, these graduates are a good source of (often untapped) market information and insight on your program. Via email or telephone, ask them about their current work - industry and role; what their income is; whether they are supported; and their career plan going forward. Also see (B) below for examples on questions you can use to collect their feedback on your programming.

- **Government partnerships:** Using field and telephone surveys, central authorities in many African countries tasked with overseeing TVET activities are taking on the responsibility of tracking former students after they graduate from institutions. Work with the local government to tap into resources from their statistical bureau, or lobby to embed these processes within existing funding and partnership agreements with national bodies. For example, in Niger, the regional TVET authorities and central government collaborate to conduct local surveys through the outreach antenna of their statistical bureau.

- **Employer or nongovernmental partnerships:** Some nonprofits or employers have established research and learning teams, who might offer in-kind support to support in collection and analysis of career outcome data in particular. Where possible, TVETs can use to collect their feedback on your programming.

**Example (Case 9)**

Generation Kenya rigorously tracks short and long term success and well-being of former students. They also calculate the return on investment for employers, and the level of program efficacy after graduates begin working at respective structures. For impact on graduates, beyond the basic metrics such as percentage of graduates that are placed into jobs and remain employed in a relevant field, Generation examines profession-specific productivity and quality outcomes of Generation graduates relative to non-Generation graduates; and analyzes their professionalism (for example, reduced absenteeism and disciplinary actions), how long graduates stay on the job, and how quickly they advance to the next step on the career ladder relative to peers.
8. COLLECT CONTINUOUS FEEDBACK BOTH EMPLOYER PARTNERS AND ALUMNI

It is important to nurture established partnerships to identify and expand opportunities for closer collaboration. For this to be successful, dedicated partnership managers can play a critical role in developing closed-loop feedback mechanisms with the partners.

**WHAT**

Effective partnerships do not end at placements, but also cater for the long term retention of the graduate, and provide credible career advancement opportunities after the initial placement. TVETs need to work with HR managers and leadership of employer partners to understand not only what it takes to make a hire, but also to ensure the graduate is equipped with the right skills to grow within the firm in the future.

**WHY**

Continuous feedback mechanism entails:
- Soliciting continuous feedback on the partner’s needs, and the TVET graduates’ performance on the job.
- Tracking the career journeys of the TVET graduates from when they are placed for the next 3-5 years to understand factors driving success (or failure). Collecting feedback on their challenges and where possible, connecting them to relevant resources.
- Discussing additional opportunities for partnership e.g. inviting the partner to support curriculum delivery if they are currently only engaged in curriculum design.

**HOW**

Examples of survey questions include:

- **Internship Questionnaire**
  - What departments at (company) do the former TVET students work in?
  - How many interns does the company accept from the TVET?
  - How often does your company accept interns from the TVET?
  - What kind of job do those interns do in your workplace? (Multiple answers allowed.)
  - How satisfied are you with the skills of the interns?
  - Do you consider hiring the interns as regular employees after they complete the internship depending on their performance during the internship?
  - If you have any opinions or comments on internship students and/or such systems, toward management personnel, or even to the government, please state;

- **Employment Questionnaire**
  - In general, what would you expect from the TVET?
  - Please state if you have any opinions or comments on the TVET including their contents of operation/management, academic curriculums, students/teachers’ activities, etc.
  - Please state, what type of human resources would you require from the TVET as contributors for industry development in the country? Please describe the technical fields and level.

- **Employer on TVET Questionnaire**
  - How many graduates from the TVET did you hire during the last 4 years?
  - Among newly hired graduates, how many are the same students accepted as an internship student previously?
  - What departments at your company do the newly employed graduates work in?

- **Employer on TVET Questionnaire**
  - How many graduates from the TVET did you hire during the last 4 years?
  - Among newly hired graduates, how many are the same students accepted as an internship student previously?
  - What departments at your company do the newly employed graduates work in?

**WHAT**

Individual TVETs collect and sift through large volumes of different types of data. Within one country, there are multiple data points which are often unanalyzed and unutilized. An integrated, or shared, or collaborative learning system integrates data across different departments within a TVET as well as incorporates information from other actors in the region.

**WHY**

Cross-sector learning could be leveraged to enhance the performance of a single TVET (as suggested in A and B), and we could also generate insights to improve the entire ecosystem of technical and vocational education.

**HOW**

Developing a functional and reliable learning system is a long-term process, and requires experts to partner with or be hired within TVETs. We suggest TVETs aim to do the following:

- **Build a monitoring system and a learning culture.** Profile TVET participants and establish effective follow-up systems to determine program performance as suggested above.
- **Leverage technological solutions** to increase usability, reliability, and efficiency of your monitoring system. This might include contributing your data to a regional Labour Market Information Systems (LMIS). LMIS are tools used to disseminate statistics on the labor market that are condensed and structured in a manner that is easily digestible for users. LMIS allow for TVETs to make decisions that relate to trends in the labor market which include popular industries youth are gravitating to and where gaps in employment are occurring.
- **Drive thought leadership** by joining local technical working groups, national TVET policy bodies, and present lessons from your data at relevant forums. A TVET rated 5 in this component would invest in a simple website or digital platform that houses and disseminates their lessons over time.

*Quality TVET for the successful transition to employment transition of Africa’s youth (p. 11)*

*Data collection survey technical and vocational education and training in the Republic of Rwanda*
Explore innovative TVET business models, and push for cost-share agreements with employer partners

**A. EXPLORE INNOVATIVE TVET BUSINESS MODELS, AND PUSH FOR COST-SHARE AGREEMENTS WITH EMPLOYER PARTNERS.**

**WHAT**

Financial sustainability refers to the capacity of TVETs to sufficiently fund their core activities, invest in growth areas and establish revenue sources sufficient to ensure longevity of the institution.

**WHY**

First and foremost, TVETs serve trainees and employers. Financial sustainability empowers TVETs to prioritize delivering results to these primary ‘customers’ over the long term at quality and at scale.

**HOW**

In terms of pedagogical, administrative, and financial management, both state/public and private TVETs can achieve greater levels of autonomy through strong business planning and performance-based contracts. The former enables TVET managers to develop strategies which ensure short-term costs are catered for, while investing for growth. Performance-based contracts, on the other hand, incentivizes excellence and scale by rewarding TVETs based on predefined standards for results, like: trainees completing courses on time; graduates passing competency tests; graduates in formal employment; graduates earning income through entrepreneurship. TVETs must invest in and cooperate with internal and external audits so that they remain fully accountable to both program costs and the resultant outcomes.

Furthermore, TVETs can explore other revenue sources in addition to government funding and subsidies. These include:
- tuition and other fees paid by trainees and their families;
- enterprise contributions including payroll levies on employers and other cost-sharing agreements;
- community support and donations;
- production and sale of goods and services by training institutions. A word of caution: while such programs could provide practical experience to trainees, there are ethical concerns if trainees are unpaid (and exploited) while generating income for the TVET.

Establish internal controls, and advocate for greater autonomy over programming with local and national governments

**A. ESTABLISH INTERNAL CONTROLS AND EMPOWER LEADERSHIP TO ADVOCATE FOR GREATER AUTONOMY**

**WHAT**

Governance refers to both the leadership and the institutional systems of TVETs. Adaptive governance is a flexible and data-driven or learning-based model for decision-making and collaboration.

**WHY**

In order to initiate and sustain demand-based TVET systems, TVETs need strong management and nimble organizational processes. Adaptive governance encompasses team development, strategy design, procurement and accountability procedures, sector coordination among others.

**HOW**

National contexts vary significantly, and even within a single TVET, you are juggling different stakeholders and considerations. This will necessarily affect your governance approach and the systems in place to support that model. Even so, we recommend the following general principles:
- Work with organizational departments responsible for compliance to develop simple and efficient processes for greater agility. This needs to be proactive, rather than reactive to challenges when they arise. In order to adjust budgets as needed, and support team leaders to be proactive within their departments, finance and procurement processes, for instance, need to be equipped to collaborate flexibly while ensuring accountability.
- Strive for structured flexibility in program strategy. Provide an overarching structure, it is difficult moving away from static, prescriptive planning to dynamic and diversified planning, but we suggest that you provide an overarching structure and define where adaptation and change is expected. For example, TVETs could prepare a “market demand-based curriculum toolkit” which provides clear guidance for trainers on how to interpret market data, which aspects of their course may need adapting, and what criteria they can use to ensure the quality remains consistently high. Encourage reflective use of program and market data.
- Foster appetite for risk and learning through modeling by senior management. For TVET staff at all levels to feel empowered and act collaboratively, leadership should develop channels for communication and a culture of sharing so that collaboration is not only organic, but deliberate and sustained.

Some tips to get you started on creating a collaborative culture as part of your demand-based approach:

- Nominate the champion: you need a person with strong leadership qualities to guide the transition to a demand-based approach. They must have social influence within the TVET, optimistic and with some experience leading change initiatives.
- Recruit the innovators: create a circle of trainers or staff who believe in your initiative and are ready to take the first steps, then include the others who are wary of change.
- Share early wins: celebrate small achievements. This helps to motivate the team and move forward to the next level.
- Communicate clearly and consistently: all the stakeholders at different levels need to be involved. Communication is key. Clarify the outcomes expected. Inform guardians, colleagues, and learners (the TVET community).
- Persuade by making it simple and direct: to involve policy makers is one thing, to make them move forward and initiate change is a more difficult task. Government supervisors need first to understand the project idea, the process and how it will be implemented, because only then will they actively take part in the effort.
- Trainees are your partners: involve the participants! They love to embrace new things and challenges. Their perspectives are critical.

---

5 Improving the quality of TVET systems for youth employability in Africa. 2020

6 Adapted from Entrepreneurial learning for TVET institutions. 2020
B. REVIEW AND ADAPT PARTNERSHIPS

WHAT

As you continue to expand the type or scale of partnerships you manage, you will learn a lot from your partnerships (see our sections on feedback and adaptive governance). Based on these insights, you and your partner(s) may decide to continue the partnership as is; terminate the partnership; or scale the partnership to include other collaborators, serve more or different trainees, or support new industries.

WHY

Earlier, we proposed some guiding principles to keep in mind as you design and manage partnerships. These are largely focused on ensuring your collaborations are shared, enabling and impact-minded. In order to consistently deliver on this goal, TVETs will have to refine and adjust their partnerships. The more collaborative (as opposed to transactional only) partnerships can also be used to create a platform for joint action or advocacy and attract other networks and/or funding—while allowing partners to learn collectively from good practices and stay informed on relevant or emerging issues.

HOW

A TVET may decide to terminate a partnership for any of the following reasons:

- You set a fixed goal and accomplished it. Well done!
- After assessment, either you or your collaborator is not benefitting as expected from the partnership. This happens as partnership design is quite tricky. If there is interest, see below on adapting your partnership instead of completely terminating.
- After assessment, the partnership is not generating impact at all, or to the extent you envisioned. Again, see below for some alternatives.
- There were legal, financial or other compliance issues related to the partnership. This will require you to work closely with the relevant teams to ensure future engagements are ethical, safe and accountable.

If you decide to close out a partnership, remember the following:

- Conduct a formal debrief with all key stakeholders. Review all aspects of the partnership together, and clarify what is next in the relationship. Remember, you can close out a specific partnership/project but collaborate with some or all of the other actors in a different capacity.
- Document what was difficult, what went well and incorporate these insights into existing and future partnerships. Where possible, share with other TVETs.

Relationship assessment: Assess whether we are on track to have an effective relationship with a private partner that will keep them engaged and active.

Section 7: Appendix and references

List of people we have interviewed

- 05.19.2021 Regional Coordinators Interview, GIZ
- 05.19.2021 Helen Cyr, Technical Advisor, Education Development Center
- 05.21.2021 Nicola Tissi, TVET Expert, IIEP-UNESCO Dakar
- 05.26.2021 Ndungu Kahihu, Executive Director, CAPYEI
- 05.27.2021 Multiple Reps, GOYN South Africa (Accenture and Harambee)
- 05.27.2021 Ebhie Ugberaese, Training Operations Lead, WAVE
- 06.22.2021 Wayne Adams, CEO, MerSeta South Africa
References

• HACKATHON Background information on track 2 «PPP in VET»
• Development PPP in Technical Vocational Education and Training
• AFRICAN UNION AGENDA: 2063 African Critical Technical Skills
• Continental Education Strategy 2016-2025
• Reflections on Public-Private Financing of TVET in West Africa
• Skills Development & Youth Employability in West Africa
• Developing PPP in Guinea-Bissau: Implementation of the Strategic Framework
• 5th Africa Think Tank Summit
• Diversifying the Funding Sources for TVET
• Actors and Partnerships in Vocational Education and Training
• The Financing of Vocational Training in Africa
• AUDA-NEPAD: TVET Partnership With Private Sector Survey Data Analysis Presentation
• Supporting private sector engagement in demand-led technical and vocational education and skills development

External Resources

Corporate Social Responsibility. Department for International Development (DFID), n.d.
The report presents an overview of corporate social responsibility (CSR), the link between CSR and poverty reduction, and suggestions on what governments can do to promote CSR including regulation, facilitation, partnerships, and endorsement. It includes a view on the four forces that drive CSR engaged in a dynamic process: the consumers (marketplace), the investment climate, civil society and the workplace.

Creating Shared Value, How to Fix Capitalism and Unleash a Wave of Innovation and Growth.
Michael E. Porter and Mark R. Kramer. 2011
This article provides a good overview of shared value, a business approach that links value creation for business to greater social impact.

Doing Business with the Poor; a field guide, World Business Council on Sustainable Development. 2005
This guide discusses the concept of the sustainable livelihoods (SL) business model defined as “doing business with the poor in ways that benefit the poor and benefit the company.” It includes a series of case studies that support various aspect of that model.

The Donor Committee for Enterprise Development (DCED)
The DCED promotes economic opportunity and self-reliance through private sector development (PSD) in developing countries. It is the forum in which donor and UN agencies share their practical experience of PSD, and agree on guidance on good practice. It is also a leading source of knowledge about PSD.
http://www.enterprise-development.org

The Engine of Development: The private sector and prosperity for poor people. DFID. May 2011
This publication outlines the growing focus at DFID on the importance of the private sector for development. It reviews why and how DFID plans to engage with the private sector, and what results they expect to see from that effort.

Making Markets Work for the Poor – HUB
M4P Hub is a knowledge and exchange forum for all those interested in making markets work better for the poor (M4P).
http://www.m4phub.org

microLINKS. microLINKS is a dynamic knowledge-sharing Web site designed to improve the impact of USAID-funded microenterprise programs and activities. Created through USAID’s Accelerated Microenterprise Advancement Project (AMAP), microLINKS shares cutting-edge research and serves as a meeting place through which visitors can share their own experiences and knowledge.
http://www.microlinks.org

This website includes aggregated economic and business enabling environment data drawn from other sources for 183 countries.
http://rru.worldbank.org/besnapshots/

Doing Business Reports. World Bank.
Annual publication from the World Bank provides an overview of the business enabling environment across the world. This site also includes some country-specific and regional reports although not all updated yearly.
http://doingbusiness.org/reports

Enterprise Surveys: World Bank.
This website provides comprehensive company-level data in emerging markets and developing economies. Business data are available on 130,000 firms in 125 countries.
http://enterprisesurveys.org/